

## Origin of Soul in Sadra's Evolutionary View and Emergentism Evolutionary View

Mohammad Mahdi Amosoltani\*  
Mohammad Mahdi Alimardi\*\*

### Abstract

In the theological discussions of Christianity, which is not alien to the theological issues of Islam, there are three broad views on the soul's origin: traducianism, creationism and pre-existence view. But today, in philosophy of religion and literature of mind, William Hasker posits an alternative view of origins called emergent substance dualism.

Tertullian believed in traducianism that means "souls following the creation of the first pair (i.e. Adam and Eve) successively generate additional souls (i.e. diachronically not synchronically) where souls are parturient or fissile". "According to traducianism, God creates at least one soul directly and immediately". Soul is produced by physical parents and with physical body. Some verses of the holy book support this but it is not clear how immaterial soul can be generated through a completely physical process.

The view of creationism is that God creates souls directly and immediately in mother's womb. This view was supported by many early fathers of the church and some statements of the holy book.

On the pre-existence view God created all human souls prior to the creation of the world in a heavenly state. This view is based on the idea that there is a kind of "store of souls" in the sky where God stores souls and he expects to baby's body in mother' womb be created and then attaches the soul to it. This view has no holy book support.

On Hasker's emergent substance dualism, evolutionary movement, hierarchical system, systematic communications and network interactions of elements lead to emergence of novel soul, a new thing which cannot be attributed to its underlined components and relation of those components. It is the physics that has the power or ability to develop and create soul - regardless of the divine relief and assistance of God. At first glance, emergentism and creationism seem to be alien; but, if causality is put aside in emergentist arguments, it becomes a magical quality. Because without any explanation, higher level features suddenly are occurred and if causation is accepted, this theory has an explanatory gap. In fact, the emergence of higher levels such as thinking from the lower level neurological events needs the existence of effect to be superior than cause. If the effect is more complete, then the effect has given up something that lacks it! And then higher level features have emerged from nothing. Lower level entities can be able to produce system properties, but these properties do not exceed in their existences from the level existence of those entities.

\* Ph. D. Student of religions from University of Religions and Denominations, Qom, Iran

Mahdi.amosoltani@yahoo.com

\*\* Assistant Professor, Department of religions from University of Religions and Denominations, Qom, Iran  
(Responsible author )

alim536@outlook.com

Received: 29.04.2018

Accepted: 28.11.2018



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

assuming this scientific fact that in the course of evolution , creatures become more complex and higher than simpler and lower ones, this problem arises that how these phenomena can be realized without destroying the causality principle that: no effect can be greater than its own cause.

Sadra with offering philosophical foundations of principality of the existence, intensifying and substantial movement, analogical gradation and hierarchy of existence gave his theory of soul's corporeal origination. , there are similarities and differences between this approach and Hasker's approach.

In the monotheistic and quranic viewpoint of Sadra, everything reflects the existence of god , then the soul apparently emerge from matter but verily God diffuses as it seems that water slake, but God really slakes, or seems that doctor cures but God really cures. Because the relationship between the creatures and the creator is reflective, like as reflection of the sunlight and moonlight. therefore , if the matter is productive and the creator of the soul , this creation and production in sadra's view is reflective and true agent is God the creator of the soul .But even in sadra 's view, the body has not reflective agency and creation for soul; Body is merely receptive. Somebodies unfortunately make mistakes that in Sadra's view the producer of soul is body like evolutionism and dualist emergentism of Hasker. Sadra's view about soul origination includes creationism, evolutionism, emergentism and even pre-existence view. It has positive points of creationism, evolutionism, emergentism and even pre-existence without negative points of them.

**Keywords:** emergent substance dualism; dualism; creationism; relationship of soul and body; Corporeal origination.

### Bibliography

- Alizadeh, Bahram (1390). Soul-body problem; Sadra's monism and emergentism, Zehn, No, 45, p.5-44.
- Amoosoltani, Mohammadmahdi & Azarbayjani, Masuod (1397). free will, manifestation of immaterial substance of soul or an emergent property?, Inquiries of philosophy of religion, No.1, p.111-136.
- Ashtiani, Jalal Al-Din (1381). Sharh Bar Zad Al-Mosafer, Qom: Bustan Ketab.
- Archinov, Vladimir & Christian Fuchs (2003), Causality, Emergence, Self-Organisation, a publication of the international working group on 'Human Strategies in Complexity: Philosophical Foundations for a Theory of Evolutionary Systems, Moscow: NIA-Priroda.
- Baker, Mark & Stewart Goetz (2011), The soul hypothesis, New York, Continuum.
- Berenjkari, Reza (1392). The Soul in Quran and Narration, Published in: Soul and Body, Qom: Resarch Center for Islamic Theology and Philosophy, Vol.1, p105-144.
- Bunge, M (2010), Matter and mind: a philosophical inquiry, Springer, New York.
- Campbell, Richard (2015), The Metaphysics of Emergence, Palgrave Macmillan.
- Clarke, W. Norris (2001) The One and the Many: A Contemporary Thomistic Metaphysics, NotreDame, Indiana: Notre Dame Press.
- Clayton, Philip (2004), Mind & Emergenc, Oxford.
- Corradini, A., & O'Connor, T. (2010), Emergence in science and philosophy. New York/London: Routledge.
- Crane, Tim (2001), Elements of Mind, An Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind, New York. Oxford.
- Dyson, Freeman (1979), Disturbing the Universe, New York:Harper and Row.

- Farris, Joshua (2014), "Emergent creationism: another option in the origin of the soul debate", *Religious Studies*, 50, 321–339.
- Fazeli, Asghar (1389). *Studies of challenges on corporeal creation of soul*, Qabasat, No. 58, p. 59-84.
- Goodman, Lenne & d. Caramenico (2013), *Coming to Mind, The Soul and Its Body*, University of Chicago Press.
- Hasker, W. (2014), "The dialectic of soul and body", In: Lavazza, A., Robinson, H. (eds.) *Contemporary Dualism: A Defense*, Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group, New York, 204–219.
- Hasker, W.( 1999), *The Emergent Self*, Cornell University Press, London,.
- Hasker, William (2011) "Souls Beastly and Human", published in: *The soul hypothesis*. Mark Baker& Stewart Goetz, New York, Continuum.
- Hasker, William (2015), "Why Emergence?", Published in: Joshua R. Farris & Charles Taliaferro (eds.), *The Routledge Companion to Theological Anthropology*, Newyork Routledge.
- Ibrahimi dinani, Gholam Hossein (2002). *General Philosophical Principles in Islamic Philosophy*, Vol.1,Tehran: Institute for Humanities and Cultural Studies.
- Jambozorgi, Mohamad jafar & Saeedimehr, Mohamd (1394) *The Emergentism approach to the problem of mind, knowledge*, No 73/1, p. 51-70.
- Jeffreys, Derek S.( 2004) "The Soul is Alive and Well: Non-reductive Physicalism and Emergent Mental Properties", *Theology and Science*, 2:2, 205-225.
- Khamenei, Sayyed Mohammad (1380), *Soul in sadra's transcendent philosophy*, *Kheradname-ye Sadra Quarterly*, No.24, p. 34-42.
- Khushnevis, Yaser (1394) *Upward Mobility and Awareness*, Qom: Research Center for Islamic Theology and Philosophy.
- Lee, Patrick & Robert George (2007), *Body–Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics*, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Levine, J.(1983), "Materialism and qualia: The explanatory gap", *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly*, 64, 354–361.
- Lubashevsky, Ihor (2017), *Physics of the Human Mind*, Springer International Publishing.
- Morowitz, Harold J. (2003), "emergence of transcendence", Published in: Niels Henrik Gregersen, *From complexity to life*, New York: Oxford.
- Murphy, Nncey (2006). *Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies?*, Cambridge University Press.
- Narimani, Nima (1394). *Soul's essence on viewpoints of emergentism and Mullasadra*, *Ishsrat*, No.4,p.111-134.
- Nida-Rümelin, Martine (2007), "Dualist Emergentism", Published in: Brian Mc Laughlin, & Jonathan Cohen, *Contemporary Debates in Philosophy of Mind*. Blackwell.
- O'Connor, Timothy (2000), "Causality, Mind, and Free Will", Published in James E. Tomberlin (ed.) *Philosophical Perspectives 14: Action and Freedom*. Oxford: Blackwell, 105–117.
- O'Connor, Timothy (1994), "Emergent Properties", *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 31, 91–104.
- O'Connor, Timothy & Jonathan D. Jacobs (2000) "Emergent Individuals", *Philosophical Quarterly*, 53 (213), 540–555.
- O'Connor, Timothy (2003), "Groundwork for an Emergentist Account of the Mental", *Progress in Complexity,Information and Design*, 2.3.1, 1–14.
- O'Connor, Timothy & John Ross Churchill (2010), "Nonreductive Physicalism or Emergent Dualism?The Argument from Mental Causation",Published in: Robert C. Koons and

- George Bealer (eds.), *The Waning of Materialism: New Essays*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 261–279.
- O'Connor, Timothy (2000), *Persons and Causes: The Metaphysics of Free Will*, Oxford.
  - O'Connor, T., & H. Y. Wong (2005), "The metaphysics of emergence", *Nous*, 39, 659–679.
  - Popper, K. (1978), "Natural selection and the emergence of mind", *Dialectica* 32, 279-355.
  - Safari, Reza & Valeh, Hossein (1393). *Sadraian Monism, Sadra's wisdom*, No.5, p.125-136.
  - Searle, John (1992), *The rediscovery of the mind*, Cambridge: MIT Press.
  - Sheldrake, Rupert (2013), "Setting science free from materialism", *explore*, Vol. 9, 211-218.
  - Shahgoli, Ahmad (1390). *The analysis of the problem of monism and dualism of soul and body in Mulla Sadra's view*, *Zehn*, No46, p.101-120.
  - Shakar, Abdul Ali (1394). *Substantial Motion and Perfection of Soul after Its Separation from Body*, *Open Journal of Philosophical Theological Research*, No4, p.133-148.
  - Shirazi, Mohammad b. Ibrahim (1368). *Al-hekma Al-motaalia fi Al-asfar Al-aghliya Al-arbaa*, Vol.1-9, 2th, Qom: Maktaba Al-mostafavi.
  - Shirazi, Mohammad b. Ibrahim (1354). *Al-mabda va Al-maad*, Tehran: Iranian Philosophical Society.
  - Shirazi, Mohammad b. Ibrahim (1360b). *Al-shavahed Al-robubiyya*, 2th, Tehran: University Publication Center.
  - Shirazi, Mohammad b. Ibrahim (1360a), *Asrar Al-ayat Va Anvar Al-bayyenat*, Tehran: Iranian Philosophical Society.
  - Soroush, Abdolkarim (1384). *Nahad-e Naaram-e Jahan*, 5th ed, Tehran: Serat.
  - Stephan, Achim (2013), "theories of Emergence", Published in: Runehov, Anne L. C & Lluís Oviedo, *Encyclopedia of Sciences and Religions*, New York London: Springer.
  - Strawson, Galen (2006), "Realistic monism: why physicalism entails panpsychism", *Journal of Consciousness Studies*, 13 , 3-31.
  - Tanner, Kathryn (2005), *God and Creation in Christian Theology*, Minneapolis: Fortress Press.
  - Vimal, Ram L. P (2013), "Emergence in dual-aspect monism", Published in: Alfredo Pereira Jr. and Dietrich Lehmann(ed), *The Unity of Mind, Brain and World*, New York: Cambridge University Press.
  - Vimal R. L. P. (2008), *Proto-experiences and subjective experiences: Classical and quantum concepts*, *J Integr Neurosci* 7(1), 49–73.
  - Zimmerman, Dean (2011), "From Experience to Experiencer", Published in: Mark Baker & Stewart Goetz, *The soul hypothesis*, New York, Continuum.