

Changing the Paradigm in Nursing: from the Care Paradigm to the Islamic Paradigm

Leili Yekefallah¹ , Hamideh Azimi^{2*} 

1- Department of Critical Care Nursing, School of Nursing and Midwifery, Qazvin University of Medical Sciences, Qazvin, Iran.

2- Department of Nursing, Student Research Committee, School of Nursing & Midwifery, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran.

*Correspondence should be addressed to Ms. Hamideh Azimi; Email: H.azimi88@sbmu.ac.ir

Article Info

Received: Jan 19, 2021

Received in revised form:
Feb 1, 2021

Accepted: Mar 2, 2021

Available Online: Mar 21, 2022

Keywords:

Islam

Nursing Care

Paradigm

Postmodernism



<https://doi.org/10.22037/jrrh.v8i1.33802>

Abstract

Background and Objective: Nursing theorists have defined nursing knowledge within the framework of the governing philosophies. Nursing theories belonging to the modernist era were developed based on the principles of modernist philosophy. With criticisms about the negative consequences of modernism, nursing scientists decided to move from modernism to postmodernism and the care paradigm that originated from postmodernism. Expression of excessive criticism about the foundations of postmodernism shed doubt on the effectiveness of the care paradigm. The aim of this study was to investigate the consequences of the biomedical and care paradigm on nursing and provide an alternative and monotheistic paradigm.

Methods: The present study is library-based. The books and articles related to the most important nursing philosophies and paradigms in the time range of 1950 to 2020 were searched on the national and international databases and examined using a descriptive analytical approach. The authors reported no conflict of interests.

Results: One-dimensional view of and attention only to objective signs are among the criticisms of modernism and the biomedical paradigm, also, the lack of a solid standard of good or bad, the violation of the law of the community of contradictions by stating the acceptance of some truths in the world and the denial of general rules are among the criticisms of postmodernism and the care paradigm. The Islamic paradigm, while having the strengths of the last two paradigms, does not have their weaknesses.

Conclusion: Given the need to present a nursing paradigm based on the prevailing philosophy of any society, the Islamic paradigm is proposed as a way out of the challenges created by the current paradigm in nursing.

Summary

Background and Objective

Nursing theorists have defined nursing knowledge within the framework of governing philosophies (1, 2) in order to promote the profession and increase the effectiveness of care and satisfaction (3, 4). Due to the prevalence of modernist

philosophy for about four centuries (5, 6), the nursing theories presented at that time were based on the principles of modernism philosophy (7) as the biomedical paradigm (8). Despite advances in the experimental sciences and the tools during modernism (9), which promoted the experimental science of nursing, the consequences of the philosophical thinking of modernism, which is to look at man in a one-dimensional way and to

satisfy only his material needs, have led to criticism of modernism (10). At this time, the signs of the transition from modernism and the biomedical paradigm emerged, so attention to the care paradigm that originated in the postmodernist movement became stronger (11). Excessive criticism of the foundations of postmodernism has cast doubt over the effectiveness of the care paradigm (12, 13). Postmodernism strongly believes in humanism and the originality of language (14), being away from objectivism (11) and relativism in order to eliminate the shortcomings of modernism (15). Examples of critiques of postmodernism and the care paradigm included providing care based on the needs expressed by the patient (16), relativizing moral values (15), meaninglessness of words (11), lack of a definite criterion of good or bad (17), deviating from objectivism to subjectivism (18), violating the law of universal acceptance (19), and denial of general laws and rules (20). Although postmodernism has far more advantages than modernism, it has been contradicted by the results of various studies (12, 13). Some nursing scientists have considered the existence of some hidden dualities (21), the occurrence of complexities of health and disease experiences (22), and the unresponsiveness of the philosophy of governing nursing to these complexities (22), which opens the window of attention to other philosophies in nursing (1, 23-25). Accordingly, some studies suggest the need for theorizing based on the ideas of monotheistic philosophy as a suitable solution to overcome the challenges created (23, 26, 27) because only God, the Creator of man, is aware of all human needs, and if man and his needs are fully identified, a more complete and perfect model of care will emerge (28). The aim of this study was to investigate the consequences of biomedical and care paradigms in nursing and to present a monotheistic and alternative paradigm.

Methods

The present study is library-based. The books and articles related to the most important nursing philosophies and paradigms in the time range of 1950 to 2020 were searched on the national and international databases and examined using a descriptive analytical approach, various studies in the time range of were searched on internal and external databases.

Results

In modernism, the worldly pleasure of man, which leads to an emphasis on the material dimension of

man, is emphasized (7). Criticisms of modernism and biomedical paradigm such as not seeing all the dimensions of a human being (29), not having a holistic view of human beings (30), neglecting the effect of spirituality on health (7), and not paying attention to differences in principles and definitions in different cultures and to creativity (31) all refer to the principles of modernism (30). Nursing scientists decided to move from modernism (11, 32) to postmodernism and the care paradigm originated from postmodernism (33, 34). The care paradigm, which emphasizes the human-centeredness that is influenced by material and immaterial factors and leads to the centrality of "unique" care, a special place has been given to language to express mentalities and needs and the need to clarify the meanings of words used in relation to the patient (11). Postmodernism has a series of principles such as truth-avoidance, relativism, objectivity-avoidance, pluralism, anti-substance and anti-rationalism (14). Relativism of values and no reliable basis for good / evil (17) will lead to the loss of peace and order in society and human beings (15, 17, 35). Also, believing in no base for the world and believing in the existence of different (14) and sometimes contradictory truths (19) and the absence of general rules in the world (20), will result in the destruction of all theories (20, 36) and teaching and learning (14). It is clear that a person who believes that concepts such as care and health exist independently of our minds and in the outside world has a different care attitude than a person who believes that these concepts are nothing more than contracts and they are made by the human mind (37). In the monotheistic philosophy of Islam, there is a single truth that can be discovered with tools, so there will be no relativism and contradiction of solutions that exist in postmodernism (38, 39). Also in this philosophy, monopoly in certain methods to discover the truth is rejected (40) and with rational and empirical argument, one can really test the understanding of phenomena (41). The source of this difference is in the epistemological position of the philosophical beliefs of individuals; the epistemology of Islam is different from man-made philosophies (42). Therefore, there is a profound philosophical difference between our society, which is based on Islam, and the societies based on human philosophies (42).

Conclusion

The care paradigm was considered by nursing scientists to compensate for the shortcomings of the biomedical paradigm (15). But the main

components of postmodernism, such as fundamentalism, multi-factualism, relativism, human-centeredness, etc. (14) not only destroyed some of the strengths of modernism in nursing, but with the influence of these principles in nursing, there were consequences that led to serious criticisms of the fundamentals of postmodernism and the paradigm of caring origins. In order to express serious criticisms of the biomedical and care paradigms (8, 12, 13, 29, 43) as well as to advise nursing scientists to use other philosophies and paradigms in the conceptualization in nursing (25), Islamic philosophy and paradigm can be used in nursing because Islamic philosophy, while having the strengths of the past paradigms, does not have their weaknesses. Islam is the only comprehensive reference without divine distortion (44), and the model presented on the basis of this complete and transcendent thinking can cover aspects of human existence that are outside of other views, in addition to the aspects considered in other paradigms (42). Therefore, the paradigm based on Islamic philosophy is a good way to overcome the challenges posed by postmodernism in nursing.

Acknowledgements

The authors consider it necessary to thank Dr. Sadat Hosseini for her valuable guidance, as well as the Vice Chancellor for Research of Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences for supporting this research project.

Funding

According to the authors of the article, this study was not sponsored and was done at the personal expense of the authors.

Conflict of interest

The authors declared no conflicts of interest.

Authors' contribution

Responsible for approving the final version for publication: first author and responsible for writing the article: second author.

References

1. Nikfarid L. The Concept of human based on Iranian mysticism and wisdom: a step toward development of a nursing theory. *Journal of Pizhūhish dar dīn va Salāmat*. 2021;6(4):117-35. (Full Text in Persian)
2. Reed PG. The spiral path of nursing knowledge. *Nursing knowledge and theory innovation: Advancing the science of practice*. 2011:1-36.
3. Mayelafshar M, Khoshnavay-Fomani F, Golpira R, Bakhshandeh-Abkenar H, Momeni B, Khaleghparast S, et al. The most important nursing professional values: the perspectives of nurses who work at selected hospitals affiliated to Tehran University of medical sciences, Tehran, Iran. *Nursing Practice Today*. 2016;3(1):11-18. (Full Text in Persian)
4. Duckworth MP, O'Donohue WT. *Behavioral medicine and integrated care*. New York: Springer; 2018.
5. Rashidiyan A. *From modernism to postmodernism*. Tehran: Ney; 2016. (Full Text in Persian)
6. Sofla Y, Zakroff G. The survey of modernization process problems in contemporary of Iran and its effect on globalization. *Political Science Quarterly*. 2015;11(30):7-34. (Full Text in Persian)
7. Khosropanah A. Islam and modernism. *Journal of Kalam Islami*. 2013;22(86):125-44. (Full Text in Persian)
8. Mazzotta CP. Biomedical approaches to care and their influence on point of care nurses: as coping review. *Journal of Nursing Education and Practice*. 2016;6(1):93-101.
9. Taylor C. *The ethics of authenticity*. New York: Harvard University Press; 2018.
10. Ghaderi Z. Critique of the philosophical discourse of modernism: Nietzsche and the transition to postmodernism. *The rights of nations*. 2016;24:419-45. (Full Text in Persian)
11. Sadooghiasl A, Salsali M. Nursing knowledge development in the age of postmodernism. *Iranian Journal of Nursing Research*. 2014;9(2):38-45. (Full Text in Persian)
12. Sadat-Hosseini A, Alhani F, Khosropanah A, Behjatpour A. Explanation of meta-paradigm of human in Islamic sources and nursing theories. *Journal of Research Development in Nursing and Midwifery*. 2013;9(2):36-48. (Full Text in Persian)
13. Yekefallah L, Ashktorab T, Manoochehri H, Alavi-Majd H. Futile care: why intensive care nurses provide it? a phenomenologic study. *Global journal of health science*. 2015;24(87):1-14. (Full Text in Persian)
14. Asef-Muhseni M. The analysis and criticism of post-modernism's look at educating the values. *Journal of Islam and Educational Research*. 2013;5(1):25-52. (Full Text in Persian)
15. Forghani N, Keshtiaray N, Yousefy A. A critical examination of postmodernism based on religious and moral values education. *International Education Studies*. 2015;8(9):98-106.
16. Sadat-Hosseini A. The need to replace the paradigm of wisdom with the paradigm of care in the Iranian Islamic model of health system development.

Tehran: Pattern of Progress Publications affiliated with the Center for Iranian Islamic Pattern of Progress; 2017. (Full Text in Persian)

17. Dehbani-Poor R, Khorram-Poor Y. Investigating the components of postmodernism and its related factors. *Journal of Socio-Cultural Development Studies*. 2017;4(4):53-77. (Full Text in Persian)

18. Maleki H, Hakimzadeh R, Khaleghinezhad S. Critique of postmodern viewpoint in curriculum based on philosophical foundations of Islamic education. *Transformation Studies in the Humanities*. 2016; 3(5): 32-62. (Full Text in Persian)

19. Tabatabaee MH. Nahayat ol-hikmah. Tehran: Markaze-Nashre-Daneshgahi; 2013. (Full Text in Arabic)

20. Emami A, Salsali M, Basiri H. Comparative survey between quantitative and qualitative paradigms (part II). *Journal of Holistic Nursing and Midwifery*. 2012;22(6):55-60. (Full Text in Persian)

21. Alimohammadi N, Taleghani F, Mohammadi E, Akbarian R. Nursing in Islamic thought: reflection on application nursing metaparadigm concept: a philosophical inquiry. *Iran Nursing Inquiry*. 2014;21(2):121-9.

22. Melise I. Theoretical nursing development and progress. Washington: Lippincott Williams & Walkins; 2007.

23. Rassool G. The crescent and Islam: healing, nursing and the spiritual dimension. Some considerations towards an understanding of the Islamic perspectives on caring. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*. 2000;32(6):1476-84. PMID: 11136416

24. Sadat-Hosseini A, Alhani F, Khosropanah A, Behjatpour A. Describing the Necessity Of Using Islamic Concepts In Theorizing The Nursing. *Akhlaghe Zisti (i.e., Bioethics Journal)*. 2012;2(4):93-114. (Full Text in Persian)

25. Fawcett J. The metaparadigm of nursing: Present status and future refinements. *Journal of nursing scholarship*. 1984;16(3):84-7.

26. Ismail S, Hatthakit U, Chinnawong T. Islamic based caring in nursing science: a literature review. 3rd AASIC: Sustainable Development of Asian Community. 2015:100-6.

27. Sadat Hoseini AS. A proposed Islamic nursing conceptual framework. *Nursing science quarterly*. 2019;32(1):49-53.

28. Alhani F, Sadat-Hosseini A, Khosropanah A, Behjatpour A. A critical study of liberalism in nursing practice. *Teb va Tazkieh*. 2011;19(3):47-61. (Full Text in Persian)

29. Palvish C, Hunt R. An exploratory study about meaningful work in acute care nursing. *Nursing Forum*.

2012;47(2):113-22. PMID: 22512769

30. Davabi H. A critique of the foundations of modernism. Karaj: Alborz Sarafrazan; 2017. (Full Text in Persian)

31. Karimi M, Naderi E, Seif-Naraghi M. Postmodern curriculum model and its application in the nursing education system in Iran: design and evaluation of the model. *Journal of Nursing Education*. 2017;6(3):47-55. (Full Text in Persian)

32. Warelow P. Changing philosophies: a paradigmatic nursing shift from Nightingale. *Australian of Advanced Nursing*. 2014;31(1):36-45.

33. Ghorbani F, Salsali M. Concept of holistic in nursing: a review article. *Journal of Education and Ethics in Nursing*. 2018;7(3&4):23-30. (Full Text in Persian)

34. Zardosht R. Nursing care and postmodernism. *Future of Medical Education Journal*. 2020;10(2):56-7.

35. Taheri-Sarteshnizi E, Azizkhani A. A critical study on postmodern view of man with regard to religious teachings. *Ensan Pajoohe Dini*. 2011;8(25):35-57. (Full Text in Persian)

36. Zahed F. Postmodernism and the impact of nihilism on it. *Journal of Epistemological Research*. 2013;2(5):103-14. (Full Text in Persian)

37. Sadat-Hosseini A, Alhani F, Khosropanah A, Behjatpour A. Intellectual nursing. New theories in nursing based on Islamic document. Tehran: Andishe-Rafie; 2014. (Full Text in Persian)

38. Aghili S, Khosropanah A, Tayyeb-Taher A. Communication knowledge methodology; an introduction to Islamic methodology. *Media Studies*. 2011;6(2):9-25. (Full Text in Persian)

39. Khosropanah A, Baneshi A. Reflection on the foundations of Western theorizing and the Iranian Islamic model of progress and its necessity in the field of organizational leadership. *Iranian Islamic Model of Progress Conference*; Tehran. 2013. (Full Text in Persian)

40. Kafi M. The purpose of science in the paradigm of Islamic sciences. *Islam and Social Sciences*. 2017;8(6):61-82. (Full Text in Persian)

41. Mesbah-Yazdi M. Philosophy teaching. Tehran: International Publishing Company; 2013. (Full Text in Persian)

42. Sadat-Hosseini A, Alhani F, Khosropanah A, Behjatpour A. Describing the Necessity of Using Islamic Concepts in Theorizing the Nursing. *Akhlaghe Zisti (i.e., Bioethics Journal)*. 2012;2(4):93-114. (Full Text in Persian)

43. Udo C, Danielson E, Melin-Johansson C. Existential issues among nurses in surgical care-a hermeneutical study of critical incidents. *Journal of*

Advanced Nursing. 2012;69(3):5679-770. PMID: 22591004

44. Motahhari M. Ensan-e kamel. Tehran: Sadra; 2013. (Full Text in Persian)